

EVALUATING THE MERITS AND DEMERITS OF THE 18TH AMENDMENT TO THE 1973 CONSTITUTION OF PAKISTAN

Humaira Khatoon

Lecturer Political Science, Department of Political Science Govt, Girls' Degree College Jacobabad Sindh.

Email: humerashah8@gmail.com

<https://orcid.org/0009-0008-9241-4011>

Abstract

The 18th Amendment to the 1973 Constitution of Pakistan, enacted in 2010, marks a significant juncture in Pakistan's constitutional evolution. This research article critically examines the multifaceted impact of this constitutional reform by evaluating both its merits and demerits. The primary objective of the 18th Amendment was to decentralize power, strengthen provincial autonomy, and redefine the federal-provincial relationship within the country's governance framework. The merits of the 18th Amendment are evident in several areas. Firstly, it bolstered provincial autonomy by redistributing powers and subjects from the Concurrent Legislative List to the exclusive domain of the provinces, thereby empowering them to make decisions on local issues. This enhanced autonomy facilitated more effective governance at the provincial level, allowing for tailored responses to regional challenges. Additionally, the devolution of powers and resources to local governments fostered a deeper sense of grassroots democracy, encouraging active citizen participation in governance processes. However, the amendment also brought forth certain demerits and challenges. Despite the augmented provincial autonomy, concerns arose regarding the equitable distribution of fiscal resources among the provinces. The absence of a robust mechanism to address financial imbalances hindered the effective implementation of devolved powers, impacting the delivery of essential services. Furthermore, critics voiced apprehensions regarding the potential erosion of national unity due to excessive provincial autonomy. The shift of powers away from the federal government led to debates regarding the weakening of central authority and its implications for national cohesion. In conclusion, while the 18th Amendment introduced crucial reforms aimed at strengthening democratic governance and decentralizing power, it also unveiled challenges related to fiscal imbalances and potential threats to national unity. Striking a balance between provincial autonomy and

International Research Journal of Religious Studies, Vol.03, Issue: 02 July-Dec 2023
federal authority while addressing these challenges remains imperative for the sustained stability and progress of Pakistan's governance structure.

Keywords: Decentralization of Power, Devolution, Financial Imbalances, Grassroots Democracy, Constitutional Reform.

INTRODUCTION

The 18th Amendment to Pakistan's 1973 Constitution, enacted in 2010, stands as a pivotal milestone in the nation's constitutional history. This amendment represents a concerted effort to redefine the power structure, specifically aiming to decentralize authority and redefine the relationship between the federal and provincial entities. Its enactment resulted in significant alterations to the distribution of powers, emphasizing the enhancement of provincial autonomy within the country's governance framework.

With the central goal of devolving powers and responsibilities from the federal government to the provinces, the 18th Amendment sought to address historical grievances stemming from a centralized power structure. By granting provinces more authority in decision-making processes, this constitutional reform aimed to create a more inclusive and participatory governance framework tailored to regional needs. Nevertheless, the implementation of this landmark amendment has been a subject of debate and scrutiny. Advocates applaud its efforts to empower provinces and promote a more responsive and accountable system of governance. However, critics have raised concerns about the potential challenges arising from disparities in financial resources among provinces and the impact of heightened provincial autonomy on national unity and cohesion.

Decentralization of power:

Decentralization of power refers to the redistribution of authority, responsibilities, and decision-making capabilities from a central governing body to subnational or local entities within a country Cheema, G. S., & Rondinelli, D. A. (2007). In the context of the 18th Amendment to Pakistan's Constitution, decentralization aimed to enhance provincial autonomy by transferring certain powers from the federal government to the provinces Malik, S. (2012). This transfer of authority sought to address historical grievances related to the concentration of power at the center and aimed to empower provinces to make decisions on local matters more independently (Shah, 2014). Decentralization in Pakistan through the 18th Amendment attempted to create a more responsive and inclusive governance structure by allowing provinces greater control over various subjects previously under federal jurisdiction Bizenjo, M. H. (2018). However, challenges such as fiscal imbalances among provinces emerged due to insufficient mechanisms to address resource distribution, highlighting the complexities associated with effective decentralization efforts Zaidi, S. A. (2016). Despite these challenges, decentralization remains a crucial aspect of governance reforms aimed at promoting local participation, responsiveness,

and tailored governance solutions .

Background:

The background leading to the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan is rooted in the country's historical struggles with constitutional stability, federal-provincial power dynamics, and the quest for genuine democracy.

Historical Context of Constitutional Evolution:

After gaining independence in 1947, Pakistan underwent a tumultuous journey in establishing a stable constitutional framework. Burki, Shahid Javed. (2011). The country initially functioned under the Government of India Act 1935, which was the basis of its first constitution in 1956. However, this constitution faced challenges due to political instability, resulting in its abrogation in 1958 by General Ayub Khan's military regime.

Military Interventions and Constitutional Amendments:

Pakistan experienced several periods of military rule, notably under General Zia-ul-Haq (1977-1988), during which the constitution underwent significant alterations. The Eighth Amendment in 1985 concentrated power in the hands of the President, undermining democratic principles, decentralization, and federalism. Khan, Hamid. (2014). These amendments weakened the parliamentary system and the autonomy of provincial governments.

Return to Democracy and Reformative Efforts:

The restoration of democracy in 2008 with the Pakistan People's Party (PPP) coming into power marked a significant shift. Khan, A. (2018). The PPP, under the leadership of Asif Ali Zardari, campaigned for the restoration of democratic principles, parliamentary supremacy, and greater provincial autonomy. Khan, A. (2018). This period saw a renewed focus on constitutional reforms to address past distortions and strengthen democratic institutions.

Demand for Greater Provincial Autonomy:

One of the key motivations behind the 18th Amendment was the demand for increased provincial autonomy. Provinces sought greater control over resources, administrative functions, and policymaking within their jurisdictions. Haider, M. (2017). The amendment aimed to decentralize power from the federal government to the provinces, allowing them more autonomy in managing their affairs.

Consensus-Building and Amendment Process:

The process of formulating the 18th Amendment involved extensive consultations, negotiations, and consensus-building among various political parties, civil society representatives, legal experts, and stakeholders. Ahmed, S. (2015). The aim was to develop a comprehensive and inclusive amendment that addressed the grievances and aspirations of different stakeholders while strengthening democratic principles.

Ratification and Implications:

The eventual ratification of the 18th Amendment in 2010 represented a significant milestone in Pakistan's constitutional history. It aimed to restore the original spirit of the 1973 Constitution, redress power imbalances, and promote federalism, parliamentary supremacy, and democratic governance. Rashid, A. (2019). The background leading to the 18th Amendment reflects Pakistan's struggle to establish a stable and inclusive constitutional framework that upholds democratic values, ensures equitable distribution of power between federal and provincial entities, and addresses historical distortions for the country's political and socio-economic development.

Devolution of Power:

Devolution of power refers to the process of transferring decision-making authority, responsibilities, and resources from a central or higher level of government to lower or regional levels within a country's administrative framework Ahmad, E., & Brosio, G. (2006). In the context of the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan, devolution played a pivotal role in redistributing powers from the federal government to the provinces. This transfer of authority aimed to empower provinces by allowing them greater control over local affairs and decision-making processes Shah, R. (2014).

The devolution process following the 18th Amendment entailed the shifting of various subjects from the Concurrent Legislative List to the exclusive domain of the provinces, granting them autonomy in areas such as education, health, and local government Bizenjo, M. H. (2018). This decentralization sought to address regional disparities, foster grassroots democracy, and facilitate more efficient governance tailored to the specific needs of each province (Malik, S. (2012). By devolving powers to the provinces, the amendment intended to create a more responsive and accountable system of governance, encouraging active citizen participation and localized solutions to regional challenges Shah, R. (2014). However, challenges related to fiscal imbalances and ensuring a balance between provincial autonomy and national unity have emerged in the aftermath of this significant devolution of power (Zaidi, 2016).

Financial imbalances:

Financial imbalances resulting from the 18th Amendment to the 1973 Constitution of Pakistan have been a subject of significant concern and debate. While the amendment aimed to empower provinces and enhance their autonomy, it did not provide a robust mechanism to address fiscal disparities among provinces Zaidi, S. A. (2016). The absence of clear guidelines for equitable distribution of financial resources led to challenges in sustaining the devolved powers. This situation hindered the effective delivery of essential services, including healthcare and education, as some provinces struggled due to insufficient funds (Bizenjo, M. H. (2018). The lack of a comprehensive

fiscal framework exacerbated disparities, impacting the overall effectiveness of the devolution process and impeding the intended benefits of enhanced provincial autonomy.

Literature Review :

The 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan, ratified in 2010, remains a subject of substantial scholarly discourse, inviting analysis of its merits and demerits regarding its impact on Pakistan's political, administrative, and social dynamics. The amendment's fundamental objective was to enhance provincial autonomy, devolve power, and reinforce democratic principles Hussain, M. (2017).

One of the prominent merits of the 18th Amendment lies in its emphasis on devolution of power and provincial autonomy. Hussain, M. (2017). notes that the transfer of subjects from the Concurrent List to the provinces enabled them to independently manage various domains, such as health, education, and social welfare. This move aimed to address historical grievances and empower provinces in decision-making processes, thus fostering a sense of ownership and responsibility.

Moreover, the amendment was designed to strengthen federalism by redefining the distribution of powers between the federal and provincial governments Khan, F. A. (2015). By ensuring a more equitable allocation of resources and authority, it aimed to mitigate historical imbalances among provinces, promoting a more balanced power structure.

Constitutional reforms introduced by the amendment were hailed for enhancing democratic stability by limiting the powers of the President and reinforcing parliamentary democracy Malik, S. (2018). Such reforms aimed to establish a more transparent and accountable governance structure.

Despite these merits, the 18th Amendment has faced challenges and criticisms. Ahmad, R. (2019). highlights concerns regarding inter-provincial coordination, emphasizing the disparities among provinces in terms of capacities and capabilities. These differences have impeded uniform policy implementation and service delivery across the country.

Financial management and resource allocation have been a subject of contention post-amendment Raza, A. (2016). underscores the fiscal challenges arising from increased financial responsibilities without corresponding resource generation capacities at the provincial level. This has led to disparities among provinces, impacting their ability to provide essential services.

Another critical demerit involves impediments in policy implementation due to a lack of clarity and coordination Younas, S. (2020). The abrupt transfer of subjects to provinces without adequate capacity-building measures has resulted in administrative hurdles and challenges in effective governance.

Merit Devolution of Power and Provincial Autonomy:

The 18th Amendment to Pakistan's Constitution aimed to bolster provincial autonomy by devolving power to the provinces, allowing them greater control over various domains previously under federal jurisdiction Hussain, M. (2017). This decentralization intended to empower provinces, enabling independent management of critical sectors like health, education, and social welfare Hussain, M. (2017). The shift from the Concurrent List to provincial authority aimed to address historical grievances and cater to local needs, fostering a sense of ownership among provinces and contributing to a more balanced power structure Khan, F. A. (2015).

Demerit: Challenges in Fiscal Management and Resource Allocation:

However, the 18th Amendment faced challenges in aligning fiscal resources with devolved powers. Raza, A. (2016). argues that the transfer of authority to provinces did not correspond with a commensurate allocation of financial resources or revenue-generation mechanisms. This discrepancy led to fiscal disparities among provinces, impacting their capacity to uniformly provide essential services Raza, A. (2016). The absence of a comprehensive fiscal framework hindered resource distribution and affected service quality across regions, posing a significant challenge to effective governance.

Conclusion:

The 18th Amendment to Pakistan's Constitution has brought both advantages and challenges. While it aimed to strengthen provincial autonomy and democratic principles, it also encountered obstacles in effective implementation, fiscal management, and inter-provincial coordination. Addressing these challenges is crucial to maximizing the merits and mitigating the demerits of the amendment for the betterment of Pakistan's governance and socio-political landscape.



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

References

1. Cheema, G. S., & Rondinelli, D. A. (2007). From government decentralization to decentralized governance. In *Decentralizing governance: Emerging concepts and practices* (pp. 1-26). Brookings Institution Press.
2. Malik, S. (2012). Decentralization and Devolution of Power in Pakistan After the 18th Amendment. *Journal of Political Science*, 17(3), 112-127.
3. Bizenjo, M. H. (2018). The 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan: A Review of Its Implications. *Journal of Political*

Studies, 25(2), 45-59.

4. Shah, R. (2014). 18th Amendment and Its Impacts on Provincial Autonomy and Governance. *Pakistan Development Review*, 53(4), 367-382.
5. Zaidi, S. A. (2016). Fiscal Federalism in Pakistan: The 18th Amendment and Its Implications. *Pakistan Economic and Social Review*, 54(2), 189-204.
6. Ahmad, E., & Brosio, G. (2006). *Handbook of Fiscal Federalism*. Edward Elgar Publishing
7. Burki, Shahid Javed. (2011). *Historical Dictionary of Pakistan*. Lanham: Scarecrow Press.
8. Khan, A. (2018). Impact of 18th Constitutional Amendment on Democracy in Pakistan. *Pakistan Vision*, 19(2), 123-140.
9. Haider, M. (2017). Provincial Autonomy in Pakistan: A Case Study of the 18th Constitutional Amendment. *Journal of Political Science*, 14(1), 45-60.
10. Rashid, A. (2019). Federalism in Pakistan: Challenges and Opportunities Post 18th Amendment. *Journal of Governance and Policy Analysis*, 7(2), 180-195.
11. Ahmed, S. (2015). 18th Amendment to Pakistan's Constitution: A Critical Analysis. *Journal of Political Studies*, 22(2), 105-120.
12. Jaffar, Saad, Asia Mukhtar, Sardar Muhammad, and Muhammad Ayaz. "The Concept Of Human Equality: A Comparative Study In The Light Of The Qur'an And The Bible." *Webology* 19, no. 3 (2022).
13. Khalid, R. (2020). Intergovernmental Relations in Pakistan After 18th Amendment: Challenges and Prospects. *Pakistan Journal of Public Administration*, 3(1), 78-92.
14. Khan, A. (2018). Impact of 18th Constitutional Amendment on Democracy in Pakistan. *Pakistan Vision*, 19(2), 123-140.
15. Jaffar, Saad, and Abdul Rasheed Qadri. "An Overview of Fundamental Articles in Talmud (Mishnā) متن التلمود (مشنہ) کے اساسی مضامین کا اجمالی جائزہ." *IHYA-UL-ULUM* 20, no. 2 (2020).
16. Ahmad, R. (2019). Inter-Provincial Coordination in the Aftermath of the 18th Amendment. *Journal of Political Science*, 45(3), 305-320.
17. Hussain, M. (2017). The 18th Amendment: Background and Implications. *Pakistan Horizon*, 70(4), 61-73.
18. Jaffar, S., Mukhtar, M.W., Gul, S., Rehman, S., Ahmed, W., & Naseem, I. (2021). *The Law Of Kufu (Matchmaking): A Comparative Study Of The Talmud And Islamic Teachings*. International Journal of Digital Research & Innovations (IJDRI).

19. Khan, F. A. (2015). The 18th Amendment: Impact on Federalism and Governance. *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, 36(2), 89-104.
20. Malik, S. (2018). Constitutional Reforms in Pakistan: A Critical Analysis. *South Asian Studies*, 33(1), 127-141.
21. Raza, A. (2016). Fiscal Decentralization and Resource Management: Implications of the 18th Amendment. *Economic Analysis and Policy*, 52, 75-89.
22. Younas, S. (2020). Policy Implementation Challenges after the 18th Amendment. *Pakistan Administrative Review*, 64(2), 215-230.
23. Khan, F. A. (2015). The 18th Amendment: Impact on Federalism and Governance. *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, 36(2), 89-104.